



UNAIDS/PCB(23)/08.31  
10 November 2008

**23<sup>rd</sup> Meeting of the UNAIDS Programme Coordinating Board**  
**Geneva, Switzerland**  
**15-17 December 2008**

**Report on the process for nomination of the Executive Director**

**Additional documents for this item:** *none*

**Action required at this meeting - the Programme Coordinating Board is invited to:**  
give its comments on the nomination process to be taken into account for future nominations.

**Cost implications for decisions:** *none*

## INTRODUCTION

1. At its 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting held in Chiang Mai, Thailand in April 2008 the Programme Coordinating Board agreed upon a process for the nomination of the Executive Director of UNAIDS. Integral to that process was the creation of a Search Committee with the following Terms of Reference:

*“9.2 Agrees the following elements for inclusion in the Terms of Reference for the Search Committee, namely that the Committee:*

- *will ensure that the process for submitting nominations and individual applications is duly adhered to;*
- *will encourage and welcome candidates from regions from which an Executive Director of UNAIDS has not yet been appointed;*
- *will be responsible for submitting to the Chair of the CCO<sup>1</sup> the outcomes of the nomination process in its entirety, including the short list of candidates, a detailed report of the process that had been undertaken, and a full list of all candidates that had been considered;*
- *the Chair of the Search Committee will participate as an observer in the CCO interviews and nomination process and report back to the 23<sup>rd</sup> Programme Coordinating Board meeting. The CCO may also meet in closed session;*
- *will develop a scoring tool to evaluate candidates;*
- *will conduct initial interviews to screen candidates and evaluate them against the core competencies and submit qualified candidates in order of preference to the CCO;”*

2. In line with decisions 9.4 and 9.5 of the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting the Chair of the Programme Coordinating Board oversaw the establishment of the Search Committee:

*“9.4 Agrees the composition of the Search Committee as being 6 member states (2 WEOG<sup>2</sup> states and 1 from each of the other four geographical regions as defined by ECOSOC), 2 NGOs and 4 Cosponsors;*

*9.5 Agrees the process for establishment of the Search Committee as follows;*

- *Within 2 weeks of the closing of the 22<sup>nd</sup> Board meeting the Chair of the Programme Coordinating Board to invite proposals for membership from each (member state) region and constituency (NGOs and CCO); each group should present a consensus nominee if possible;*
- *Each constituency will be requested to submit the exact number of nominations to fill the number of places on the Committee for that particular constituency;*
- *If the number of nominations exceeds or is less than the number of places on the Committee for a particular constituency, the Chair of the Programme*

---

<sup>1</sup> Committee of Cosponsoring Organizations

<sup>2</sup> Western European and Others Group

*Coordinating Board will contact all members of that constituency represented on the Board for further discussion and agreement;*

- *Once the Committee is established the Chair of the Programme Coordinating Board will communicate the names of the members to all member states, PCB NGOs and Cosponsors; and*
- *The Search Committee shall elect a Chair from within its membership.”*

3. On 26 June the Chair of the Programme Coordinating Board sent an email to all the Board constituencies informing them that the Search Committee had been established with the following membership:

Member States (6):

1. Ambassador Marie-Louise Overvad (WEOG)
2. Michele Moloney-Kitts (WEOG)
3. Dr Rodrigo Síman Siri (Latin American and Caribbean States)
4. Dr Jan Mikas (Eastern European States)
5. Ambassador Sidiki Lamine Sow (African States)
6. Ambassador Sihasak Phuangketkeow (Asian States)

Cosponsors (4):

7. Kevin De Cock (WHO)
8. Sophia Kisting (ILO)
9. Jimmy Kolker (UNICEF)
10. Paul Spiegel (UNHCR)

NGOs (2):

11. Zonibel Woods
12. Gracia Violeta Ross Quiroga

## MEETINGS OF THE SEARCH COMMITTEE

4. The Search Committee met three times during the course of its work: 27 June, 5 September and 17-18 September. Reports of all its meetings were posted on the UNAIDS website.

**27 June:** the Search Committee: elected Ambassador Overvad as Chair; finalized its Code of Conduct; established its rules of procedure; approved the text of the advertisement for the post of Executive Director and selected the dailies and periodicals where the advertisement would be placed in English, French and Spanish; finalized the letter spelling out the competencies and experience for the post of Executive Director and invited the Members of the PCB and other Stakeholders to encourage applications or nominate an individual for the post; approved the scoring approach for the screening of candidates; and adopted a revised timeline for the nomination process<sup>3</sup>.

The Search Committee decided to create the largest possible distance between itself and the UNAIDS Secretariat and was, therefore, supported by an independent

---

<sup>3</sup> See “*Report of the Search Committee*” to the Extraordinary Meeting of the PCB - UNAIDS/PCB/Extraordinary Meeting/EM1.2 for all documentation cited in this paragraph

consultant hired by UNAIDS for this purpose. On 4 July, UNAIDS rented two offices in Geneva, outside of its premises, for the consultant to receive and prescreen the applications independently. An assistant, with no prior UN employment, was recruited to assist the consultant in his task. The consultant screened applications as soon as they arrived according to the scoring grid approved by the Search Committee at its first meeting and rating each competency. As a result, a compounded rating ranging from 0 to 22 was given to each application. The candidates were placed in three categories: “highly appropriate”, “meets the requirements” and “does not meet the requirements” of the position.

**5 September:** the Committee reviewed the 117 applications. 20 women and 97 men had applied for the post with the following regional distribution: 22 applicants from African States, 41 from Asian States, 2 from Latin American and Caribbean States, 1 from Eastern European States and 51 from Western European and Other States. It was found that 103 of the 117 applicants did not meet the requirement of the position and scored 6 or below out of 22. Of the remaining 14 applications, 8 were placed in the category “meet the requirements” of the position and 6 in the category “highly appropriate” for the position. One application in the former group was later withdrawn. Candidates in this category scored between 7 and 21/22 on the individual scoring sheet. The Search Committee selected seven candidates for interviews in Geneva on 17 and 18 September.

The Committee noted that in spite of the substantial number of applications, relatively few were from highly qualified candidates. The result was a limited pool from which to select a recommended list. There was in particular a paucity of viable “outside” candidates not already well known to the UNAIDS community. In conclusion the Committee expressed its regret, in its report to the Programme Coordinating Board and the Committee of Cosponsoring Organizations, that a professional recruitment firm had not been used to ensure as strong as possible a list of applicants, including applications outside of the UN system who could bring innovative insight and approaches to UNAIDS.

**17-18 September:** the Committee divided into two panels of equal size to conduct the interviews with the panel not interviewing acting as observers. Each panel was composed of two representatives of the five geographical regions, two representatives of the Cosponsors and one NGO representative. All interview sessions were chaired by the Search Committee Chair. Two Search Committee members (African States and one WEOG) recused themselves from the interview and discussion concerning one candidate to avoid the appearance of conflict of interest. The Search Committee asked a series of standard questions mirroring the competencies used in the scoring grid as well as questions tailored to each candidate to allow them to expand on information in their application.

As a result of the interviews the Search Committee, after a thorough discussion of each candidate’s performance and qualifications, decided to shortlist four candidates and placed them in two tiers: tier 1 - Michel Sidibe and Debrework Zewdie; tier 2 - Tim Barnett and Stefano Bertozzi.

## **EXTRAORDINARY MEETING OF THE PROGRAMME COORDINATING BOARD**

5. Following discussion in the PCB Bureau in July 2008 the Programme Coordinating Board Chair asked the Search Committee Chair to share the full Report of the Committee with the Board – not just the short-list. The Search Committee Chair agreed to this request, on the understanding of the full Committee that the Report would be treated as confidential and would only be made available under password protection to Board members, Cosponsors and the PCB NGO delegation. This was done via the UNAIDS website on 22 September. The PCB Bureau also agreed that the Extraordinary Meeting of the Board should be open to observers in the interests of the transparency and inclusiveness of the nomination process.
6. An Extraordinary Meeting of the Programme Coordinating Board was held on 2 October to consider the short list of candidates. Drawn from the list previously agreed at its 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting in April 2008 the Board also emphasised a number of key competencies and experience that it sought in the new Executive Director of UNAIDS. These included, inter alia<sup>4</sup>, the need for the successful candidate to have: a clear vision for the response to AIDS; strategic thinking on challenges and opportunities as well as on engagement with partners; commitment to UNAIDS's core principles; excellent inter-personal skills and sensitivities; and, experience of working in country and in the multisectoral response.
7. In considering each of the four short-listed candidates the Board noted the attributes of all, in particular those of the tier one candidates, and recommended that the CCO take into account the views expressed by the Programme Coordinating Board, as contained in the report of the meeting, in the next stage of the nomination process.

## **COMMITTEE OF COSPONSORING ORGANIZATIONS**

8. The CCO interviewed the four short-listed candidates in Geneva on 7 October. The interviews were chaired by Dr Margaret Chan, Director General of the WHO, in her capacity as Chair of the CCO. All ten Cosponsors were represented at a senior level.
9. The CCO met in New York on 23 October to agree on its recommendations which were conveyed to the UN Secretary General in a letter from Dr Chan the following day.

## **TIMELINE FOR THE NOMINATION PROCESS**

10. The following timeline includes the original actions agreed by the Programme Coordinating Board at its 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting in April 2008 as well as additional steps taken by the Search Committee:

---

<sup>4</sup> See Recommendations of the Extraordinary Meeting for the detailed list

22 <sup>nd</sup> PCB dates	22 <sup>nd</sup> PCB Agreed Action	Action Taken	Actual Date
5/4 (week 1)	Chair of PCB invites proposals for membership of the Search Committee	Email sent from Secretariat on behalf of the PCB Chair inviting nominations	9/5
16/6 (week 7)	Deadline for submission of names for Search Committee		28/5
26/6 (week 10)	Conclusion of consultations as necessary with constituency groups. Composition of Search Committee is announced and transmitted by electronic means to PCB constituencies	Email sent from PCB Chair with composition of Search Committee	26/6
18/7 (week 12)	First meeting of Search Committee		27/6
25/7 (week13)	Call for nominations and applications; to include advertisements in international media	<p>Chair of the Search Committee sent to all Member States of the PCB, Cosponsors and the NGO Delegation a letter with a profile of the position and request to encourage applications or nominate an individual for the post. Simultaneously a separate email address was opened to receive applications.</p> <p>A copy of the letter and other documentation associated with the process was posted on the UNAIDS website on 1 July in English and in other languages a few days later. Advertisements placed in English, French and Spanish in the following dailies and periodicals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– 6 July in Jeune Afrique</li> <li>– 8 and 16 July in Le Monde</li> <li>– 11 July in the Guardian Weekly</li> <li>– 12 July in The Economist</li> <li>– 13 July in El Pais</li> </ul>	30/6
22/8 (week 17)	Deadline for submission of nominations and applications	On 14 August the Search Committee, in consultation with the PCB Chair extended the deadline to 25 August.	25/8
19/9 (week 21)	Second meeting of Search Committee to review and establish a short list		5/9

		Third meeting of Search Committee and Interviews	17-18/9
26/9 (week 22)	Short list of candidates sent to the PCB for consideration at an extraordinary meeting (one day) of the Board. The Search Committee will then send the list to the CCO Chair together with any comments and recommendations of the PCB.		18/9
		Extraordinary Meeting of the PCB	2/10
26/9 (week 22)	CCO to consider the list of nominations and to interview short-listed candidates. The Chair of the Search Committee to participate as an observer in the CCO interview and formal nomination process and to report back to the 23 <sup>rd</sup> Programme Coordinating Board meeting on the process followed. The CCO may also meet in closed session.	Interviews held in Geneva  CCO meeting in New York to finalise recommendations	7/10  23/10
10/10 (week 24)	CCO to send formal nomination to UN Secretary General	CCO recommendations sent by Dr. Chan	24/10

## BUDGET FOR THE NOMINATION PROCESS

11. At its 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting the Programme Coordinating Board agreed a budget for the nomination process of USD 359,800, including the holding of an extraordinary meeting of the Board. Actual expenditures for the process were as follows:

Item of expenditure	Actual cost (USD)
Search Committee meetings (logistics):	
• 27 June	3,197
• 5 September	1,589
• 17-18 September	6,535
Travel for Search Committee members	30,599
Travel for interviewees	49,202
Extraordinary PCB Meeting	137,985
Support to Search Committee (consultant, assistant + office rental)	55,240
Advertisements in media	31,349
<b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>315,696</b>



12. It should be noted that although expenditures were made on items not foreseen in the original proposal e.g. a third Search Committee meeting and the hiring of support to the Committee, these costs were covered from savings in the cost of the Extraordinary Meeting of the Programme Coordinating Board and the fact that most Search Committee members funded their own travel or were based in Geneva.

**DECISION POINT**

13. **The PCB is invited to give its comments on the nomination process to be taken into account for future nominations.**